

We use the notation from Sec.31.2.

In the proof of Lemma 31.2.1 we pick by averaging e s.t. at least a fraction of $\delta \frac{1}{(3m)^k}$ more inputs u to C (and f) yield a sample $a(u, e) \in W$ whose trace is exactly \bar{i} than those which do yield $a(u, e) \in W$ whose trace properly contains \bar{i} (Claims 1 and 2). The error in the argument for Claim 3 is that we have no control over the number of u for which $a(u, e) \notin W$ but its trace contains \bar{i} , i.e. of the size of the set $U \setminus W$.

However, if we knew that the size of the complement of W is at most e.g.

$$w_c := \frac{1}{2} \cdot 2^{n^{1/3}} \cdot \frac{1}{(3m)^c}$$

then the argument works: w_c bounds the number of bad u and the algorithm constructed in Claim 3 gets the advantage at least (we ignore δ now)

$$\frac{1}{(3m)^k} - \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{1}{(3m)^c} \geq \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{1}{(3m)^k}$$

and the rest of the proof (bottom p.212, top p.213) remains the same.

Hence what is established in Sec.31.2 is the following statement.

Lemma A: *Under the same hypothesis as in Lemma 31.2.1, the number of samples $\omega \in \Omega$ for which $\alpha(\omega)$ is defined is at least*

$$w_c := \frac{1}{2} \cdot 2^{n^{1/3}} \cdot \frac{1}{(3m)^c}$$

where c bounds the number of queries α can ask on any sample.

Note that w_c is a nonstandard number for any $m \in \mathcal{M}_n$ and any standard c .

We would like to use Lemma A to establish

Lemma B: *There exists an infinite set $\Omega^* \subseteq \Omega_b$, $\Omega^* \in \mathcal{M}$, such that each $\alpha \in F_b$ is defined on all but an infinitesimal fraction of samples from Ω^* .*

Taking F_b^* , the family of random variables defined as F_b but restricted to Ω^* , determines model $K(F_b^*)$ for which the analogous statement to Lemma 31.2.1 (Lemma B) holds and it can be used in place of $K(F_b)$.

Lemma B can be derived by a combinatorial argument for small $m > n$ but here we shall give a model-theoretic argument which has the advantage

of being much simpler and working for any m , using a smaller set of random variables.

Namely, for any string $w \in \mathcal{M}_n$ let $F_{b,w}^{unif}$ be the family of partial random variables on Ω_b defined as F_b but allowing the algorithms computing the random variables to use as an advice only the triple (A, b, w) . This is perfectly sufficient for any application of the eventual model in Secs.31.3. and 31.4 (w can contain e.g. a proof of the τ -formula or a witness of the membership of b in an NP set R , etc.) and has the great advantage that the family $F_{b,w}^{unif}$ is now countable.

Lemma C: *Let $w \in \mathcal{M}_n$ be arbitrary. Then there exists an infinite set $\Omega^* \subseteq \Omega_b$, $\Omega^* \in \mathcal{M}$, such that each $\alpha \in F_{b,w}^{unif}$ is defined on all samples from Ω^* .*

Proof:

Enumerate $\alpha_1, \alpha_2, \dots$ the set $F_{b,w}^{unif}$ in such a way that the algorithm defining α_k runs in time $\leq m^k$ and ask at most k queries, for all $k \geq 1$.

Let $(\alpha_i)_{i < t} \in \mathcal{M}$ be its non-standard extension obtained via the \aleph_1 -saturation (see p.9).

If we take $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_k$ we can compose the programs defining the α s by first running α_1 , if it is not aborted then instead of outputting a value run α_2 , etc. , and output (arbitrary) values only at the end, if the computation is not aborted earlier. The resulting function is computed in time $O(km^k)$ using at most $k(k+1)/2 \leq k^2$ queries. Hence by Lemma A it is defined on at least w_{k^2} samples from Ω_b . This yields the following

Claim: For each standard $k \geq 1$ there exists definable subset $\Omega^k \subseteq \Omega_b$ of size at least w_{k^2} such that all $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_k$ are defined on all samples from Ω^k .

By Overspill the statement of the Claim holds also for the sequence $(\alpha_i)_{i < s}$ for some non-standard $s < t$, and we can take s small enough (but still non-standard) such that $\Omega^* := \Omega^s$ satisfies the statement of the lemma.

q.e.d.